## BEFORE THE TENNESSEE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

IN RE: Thomas F. Fitzgerald

Map 104-01-0, Parcel 411.00

Residential Property

Tax Year 2005

**Davidson County** 

# **INITIAL DECISION AND ORDER**

## Statement of the Case

The subject property is presently valued as follows:

LAND VALUE IMPROVEMENT VALUE

TOTAL VALUE

ASSESSMENT

\$40,000

\$77,200

\$117,200

\$29,300

An appeal has been filed on behalf of the property owners with the State Board of Equalization. The appeal was timely filed on December 1, 2005.

This matter was reviewed by the undersigned administrative law judge pursuant to Tennessee Code Annotated, §§ 67-5-1412, 67-5-1501 and 67-5-1505. A jurisdictional hearing was conducted on March 28, 2006 at the Davidson County Property Assessor's Office. Present at the hearing were Thomas Fitzgerald and Trudy Biggs, the appellants, and Davidson County Property Assessor's representative, Jason Poling.

## FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Subject property consists of a single family residence located in Nashville, Tennessee.

The initial issue is whether or not the State Board of Equalization has the jurisdiction to hear the taxpayer's appeal. The law in Tennessee generally requires a taxpayer to appeal an assessment to the County Board of Equalization prior to appealing to the State Board of Equalization. Tenn. Code Ann. §§ 67-5-1401 & 67-5-1412(b). A direct appeal to the State Board of Equalization is only permitted if the assessor does not timely notify the taxpayer of a change of assessment prior to the meeting of the County Board. Tenn. Code Ann. §§ 67-5-508(b)(2) & 67-5-1412(e). Nevertheless, the legislature has also provided that:

The taxpayer shall have a right to a hearing and determination to show reasonable cause for the taxpayer's failure to file an appeal as provided in this section and, upon demonstrating such reasonable cause, the [state] board shall accept such appeal from the taxpayer up to March 1<sup>st</sup> of the year subsequent to the year in which the assessment is made (emphasis added).

In analyzing and reviewing Tenn. Code Ann. § 67-5-1412(e), the Assessment

Appeals Commission, in interpreting this section, has held that:

The deadlines and requirements for appeal are clearly set out in the law, and owners of property are charged with knowledge of them. It was not the intent of 'reasonable cause' provisions to waive these requirements except where the failure to meet them is due to illness or other circumstances beyond the taxpayer's control. (emphasis added.) Associated Pipeline Contractors Inc. (Williamson County, Tax Year 1992, Assessment Appeals Commission, Aug. 11, 1994). See also John Orovets, (Cheatham County, Tax Year 1991, Assessment Appeals Commission, Dec. 3, 1993).

Thus, for the State Board of Equalization to have jurisdiction to this appeal, the taxpayers must show that circumstances beyond their control prevented them from appealing to the Davidson County Board of Equalization. It is the taxpayer's burden to prove that they are entitled to the requested relief.

Ms. Biggs and Mr. Fitzgerald both testified that on April 10, 2005, Mr. Fitzgerald fell and broke his hip. He was either in the hospital or the rehabilitation center until October, 2005. For a period of approximately six (6) months he was incapacitated.

The administrative judge is of the opinion that there is sufficient reasonable cause to establish that the illness and other circumstances were beyond the taxpayers control and prevented them from filing with the county board.

### **ORDER**

The administrative judge believes that "reasonable cause" exists and Mr. Fitzgerald has sustained his burden and therefore, the State Board of Equalization has jurisdiction to hear this appeal. The cause will be set for a hearing on July 18, 2006 for a hearing on the issue of value.

It is FURTHER ORDERED that any applicable hearing costs be assessed pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 67-5-1501(d) and State Board of Equalization Rule 0600-1-.17.

Pursuant to the Uniform Administrative Procedures Act, Tenn. Code Ann. §§ 4-5-301—325, Tenn. Code Ann. § 67-5-1501, and the Rules of Contested Case Procedure of the State Board of Equalization, the parties are advised of the following remedies:

- 1. A party may appeal this decision and order to the Assessment Appeals
  Commission pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 67-5-1501 and Rule 0600-1-.12
  of the Contested Case Procedures of the State Board of Equalization.
  Tennessee Code Annotated § 67-5-1501(c) provides that an appeal "must
  be filed within thirty (30) days from the date the initial decision is sent."
  Rule 0600-1-.12 of the Contested Case Procedures of the State Board of
  Equalization provides that the appeal be filed with the Executive Secretary of
  the State Board and that the appeal "identify the allegedly erroneous
  finding(s) of fact and/or conclusion(s) of law in the initial order"; or
- A party may petition for reconsideration of this decision and order pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 4-5-317 within fifteen (15) days of the entry of the order.
   The petition for reconsideration must state the specific grounds upon which

- relief is requested. The filing of a petition for reconsideration is not a prerequisite for seeking administrative or judicial review; or
- A party may petition for a stay of effectiveness of this decision and order pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 4-5-316 within seven (7) days of the entry of the order.

This order does not become final until an official certificate is issued by the Assessment Appeals Commission. Official certificates are normally issued seventy-five (75) days after the entry of the initial decision and order if no party has appealed.

ENTERED this 38th day of April, 2006.

ANDREI ELLEN LEE

ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE

TENNESSEE DEPARTMENT OF STATE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES DIVISION

c: Ms. Trudy Biggs Jo Ann North, Assessor of Property